

Substitute Guide: Analyzing Argument and Rhetoric

Course: English I (Grades 9–12) **Subject:** English Language Arts & Reading **Time:** ~50-min period or ~90-min block RLA

5-minute guide (plain language)

Students read an original argumentative essay, "Keep the Doors Open," about whether a high school should close its campus at lunch. They find the writer's **claim**, label the three **rhetorical appeals** (ethos = credibility, pathos = emotion, logos = logic/facts), tell apart **strong and weak evidence**, locate the **counterargument and rebuttal**, and then write a short **analytical response** judging how effective the argument is. On a block period, they also revise the weakest paragraph. **You do not need an English background to run this.** Everything students need — including the whole essay and the definitions of every term — is printed in their packet, and every question can be answered directly from that essay. Hand out the packet, read the opening script, let students work independently in pencil, help by reading aloud and pointing to paragraph numbers (never by giving answers), and collect every packet at the end. The answer key is a separate file for the teacher only.

Standards alignment

Framework: 19 TAC §110.36 (English I).

- **Rhetorical analysis:** analyze how rhetorical appeals (ethos, pathos, logos) and the author's choices develop the argument.
- **Evaluating argument & evidence:** evaluate whether the evidence supporting a claim is relevant, sufficient, and credible, and identify counterargument and rebuttal.
- **Revision:** revise a draft to strengthen support, reasoning, and focus.

Provisional — pending educator verification against the current official TAC source.

(Standards are paraphrased here, not quoted. Please confirm codes and wording against your official source.)

Setup Before class (5 min)

- Count and hand out one **student packet** per student.
- Confirm each student has a **pencil**. No devices or other materials are needed.
- Write the date on the board and remind students to fill in the name line.
- Keep the **answer key** with you — it is a separate file and is **not** in the student packet.
- Check the plan: is this a **standard ~50-minute period** or a **~90-minute block**? (Pacing for both is below.)

Materials What's needed

- Printed student packet (5–6 pages) per student.
- Pencil per student.
- This guide and the separate answer key (teacher only).
- No technology, no calculator, no special materials.

Timing Standard period vs. block

On a ~**50-minute period**, do Q1–Q9 and ACE (skip Q10). On a ~**90-minute block**, add Q10 (revise the weakest paragraph) and allow deeper work on Q5–Q9.

Segment	~50-min period	~90-min block	What students do
Start — Predict & warm up	5 min	7 min	Q1–Q2 (predict position + appeal match)
Build — Read the argument	12 min	15 min	Read the essay, word bank; Q3
Apply — Analyze the argument	18 min	28 min	Q4–Q8 (claim, appeals, evidence quality, counterargument/rebuttal, best-evidence choice)
Explain — Evaluate effectiveness	10 min	18 min	Q9 analytical response (C-E-R)
Explain (block) — Revise	—	10 min	Q10 rewrite the weakest paragraph
Close — ACE	5 min	7 min	Articulate / Connect / Extend
Continue — early finishers	optional	optional	Write a rebuttal paragraph

Script Read aloud to start

"Today's assignment is a reading and analysis activity called *Analyzing Argument and Rhetoric*. You will work by yourself with just a pencil — no computers. First read the short argumentative essay called *Keep the Doors Open*, which argues that a high school should not close its campus at lunch. Your job is to find the writer's main point, label how they try to persuade you — by credibility (ethos), by emotion (pathos), and by logic and facts (logos) — decide which of their support is strong and which is weak, and then judge how well the whole argument works. Every question can be answered from the essay, so if you're unsure, go back and reread. Answer the questions in order; if one is tricky, skip it and come back. Write in complete sentences where it asks you to explain, and always name the paragraph you're using. You may quietly read the essay aloud to yourself. Put your name, class period, and date at the top now. [On a block: You'll also revise the weakest paragraph in Question 10.] Raise your hand if you need a word read to you or explained."

Support When students ask for help

- **You may read any part aloud** — the essay or any question — to a student or the class.
- If they are stuck, point them to the **paragraph numbers** [1]–[7]; every answer is in the essay.
- Remind them: a **claim** is the writer's main position; **ethos** = credibility, **pathos** = emotion, **logos** = logic/facts (all defined in the packet word bank).
- For "strong vs. weak," prompt: "Is that a *fact* from a reliable source, or just an opinion or an 'everyone knows'? Does it actually connect to the campus question?"
- For Q9, remind them to **analyze, not summarize** — judge how well the support works, don't just retell it. Encourage the printed **sentence stems**.
- Do **not** give answers; prompt with "Which paragraph shows that?" or "Is the writer appealing to credibility, emotion, or logic there?"
- It is fine if a student cannot finish the optional early-finisher task, or Q10 on a short period.

Access Accommodations & language support

- **Read-aloud** of the essay or any question is allowed for all students.
- Point students to the **sentence stems** and the **word bank** (definitions provided for all seven terms).

- Extended time is fine; the core can stop after Q9 if time runs short.
- Students may answer in phrases if writing full sentences is a barrier, as long as the idea is clear and cites a paragraph.
- The packet is grayscale-safe — it prints and reads clearly in black and white.

Tools Allowed & not allowed

Allowed: pencil, the printed packet, quiet self-read-aloud. **Not needed / not allowed:** phones, computers, outside sources (everything is in the essay).

Collect at the end: Collect every packet, whether finished or not, with names on them. Stack them for the teacher. Note on a sticky how far most students got, whether it was a period or a block, and any questions that caused confusion.

Answer key: The **answer key is a separate file** (answerkey.html) and is for the teacher only. Please do not hand it to students.

Teacher follow-up (for the returning teacher)

Watch for two common patterns: students *summarizing instead of analyzing* on Q9 (retelling paragraphs rather than judging how well the support works) and *appeal mix-ups* (labeling the nurse's testimony as logos, or the survey data as pathos). A quick next-day mini-lesson contrasting a summary sentence with an analytical one, and sorting sample sentences into ethos / pathos / logos, would reinforce this well. Q5 and Q6 show who can identify and judge appeals and evidence; Q7 shows who can trace a counterargument to its rebuttal; the Q9 response — and the Q10 revision on block days — show who can evaluate an argument's effectiveness and strengthen a weak one with well-chosen support.

HS_ENG1_ArgumentRhetoric_01 — Analyzing Argument and Rhetoric Substitute Guide